

Analysis of the Role Perceptions and Legislative Performance of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation

Eun Kyung Kim, Bok Tae Kim, Sooyeon Lee,
Minjung Kim, Sunyoung Jeon



**Analysis of the Role Perceptions and
Legislative Performance of National
Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional
Representation**

©2021

Korean Women's Development Institute
225 Jinheung-ro Eunpyeong-gu
Seoul, 03367, Republic of Korea
www.kwdi.re.kr

Contents

I . Introduction	1
1. Necessity and Purpose of the Research	1
2. Research Contents and Methods	2
II . Theoretical Study on Functions of Proportional Representation and Practical Representation of Women	4
1. Roles and Expected Roles of Legislators Elected by Proportional Representation	4
2. Pursuit of National Assemblywomen's Practical Representation and the Political Party's Control	7
3. Verification of Hypotheses on the Role Perceptions of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation	9
III . Careers of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation and Legislative Activity for Practical Representation	9
1. Careers and Reelection of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation	9
2. Comparison of the 20th-term National Assemblywomen's Legislative Activity and Practical Representation	12

3. Legislative Activity in the 17th to 19th-term National Assembly by Female Legislators Reelected Once or More in the 20th-term National Assembly	15
4. Findings and Implications	19
IV. Survey Analysis of National Assemblywomen's Backgrounds to Political Participation and their Roles	19
1. Survey Overview	19
2. Political Careers and Roles of Proportional Assemblywomen ·	20
3. Policy Interest	22
4. Satisfaction with Legislative Activity and Limitations	24
5. Perceptions of the Gender Quota System and Representation of Women	26
6. Proportional Assemblywomen's Experience of Legislative Activity and Determination to Continue Careers	28
V. Overseas Cases	30
1. Cases of Nomination for Women in the Proportional Representation System Combined with the Quota System	30
2. Cases of Caucuses for Female Legislators	33
VI. Conclusions and Implications	34
1. Verification of Hypotheses through the Research	34

2. Status and Limitations of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation	36
3. Conclusions and Implications	38

Analysis of the Role Perceptions and Legislative Performance of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation

Eun Kyung Kim

Bok Tae Kim

Sooyeon Lee

Minjung Kim

Sunyoung Jeon

I . Introduction

1. Necessity and Purpose of the Research

Korean women's political representation faces many limitations as they depend on the proportional representation system. Just as one example, seen from the distribution of national assemblywomen elected by the proportional representation system by age and area, it cannot reflect the variety of gender issues as the women's community expects.

When examined by the entry type of female representatives in the 20th-term National Assembly, 15 out of the 23 reelected legislators entered the national assembly as proportional representation candidates, then they were reelected in the local constituencies. In expanding and sustaining Korean women's political representation, the proportional representation system functions as an important passage to entering politics.

In this background, this study aims to examine the structure of political opportunities for national assemblywomen elected by proportional representation to pursue practical representation. The study also aims to explore the differences and similarities of the roles expected of the national assemblywomen among politicians, women's organizations, and experts in order to reflect on the meaning of women's political representation as of year 2020.

To this end, first, we researchers examined the role perceptions of national assemblywomen recruited for politics by proportional representation and the differences between the roles perceived by assemblywomen themselves and the roles expected of assemblywomen by women's organizations and experts. Second, we explored what kinds of activity these female proportional representatives performed in the national assembly and in the political parties to realize representation of women, what were the limitations of their activity, and what opportunities were provided for these assemblywomen by the political parties that recruited them. Lastly, we seek to identify what efforts are needed in the national assembly and in the political parties to enhance the assemblywomen's gender-sensitive perceptions and to help them perform legislative activity as female representatives.

2. Research Contents and Methods

1) Research Contents

First, we analyzed the proposal and passage of bills, and women-related legislative activity of the 20th-term National Assemblywomen, then compared the legislative activities of national assemblywomen elected by proportional representation (hereinafter called 'proportional assemblywomen,')

for short) and national assemblywomen elected in the local constituencies (hereinafter called constituency-based assemblywomen.‘ We analyzed the legislative activities of assemblywomen – who were elected by proportional representation for the 20th-term National Assembly – by dividing them into three groups: i) a group who experienced the first election by proportional representation (hereinafter called the ‘first proportion’) only, ii) a group who experienced reelection by local constituencies after first elected by proportional representation (hereinafter called the ‘constituency after proportion’), and iii) a group who experienced local constituencies only,

Second, we examined how female legislators recruited for politics as proportional assemblywomen perceived their own roles, and how these roles are different from the roles expected of them by women’s organizations and experts.

Third, the proportional representation system has a strong binding power to the political parties. In this respect, we surveyed overseas countries that adopted the proportional representation system to look into how these countries nominate female politicians for proportional representation candidates. We also introduced the caucuses of female lawmakers as overseas cases to empathize with the argument that proportional representation candidates should have self-awareness.

2) Research Methods

This study adopted three research methods, including literature study, questionnaire survey, and in-depth interview. The literature study included a literature review of the functions and roles of the proportional representation system, data survey of proportional representation

candidates (for 17th-21st-term national assemblies), data survey of proportional assemblywomen's activity in the standing committees (17th-21st-term national assemblies), and overseas case survey.

The questionnaire survey was conducted to assess identities and activities of proportional lawmakers as female representatives by dividing the subjects into i) former and current national assemblywomen and ii) women's organizations and expert groups. Specifically, former and current national assemblywomen included legislators elected by proportional representation and local constituencies since the 17th-term National Assembly. Activists in women's organizations and experts in related fields were surveyed by dividing them into women's organizations, the academic community, and civic groups or organizations.

The in-depth interview survey was conducted to delve into the functions of proportional legislators and their self-evaluation of identities as female representatives in the process of political activity, the limitations they experienced in the structure of party politics, gender sensitivity in the legislative activity and the perceptions concerning the necessity of networking with women-related organizations, and perceptions concerning the meaning of making female lawmakers a political force.

II. Theoretical Study on Functions of Proportional Representation and Practical Representation of Women

1. Roles and Expected Roles of Legislators Elected by Proportional Representation

1) Roles and types of legislators elected by proportional representation

The proportional representation system is designed to understand various groups and to raise the expertise of the assembly. The legislators elected by the proportional representation system (hereinafter called ‘proportional legislators,’ for short) represent groups of people by area, such as youth, women, social minority groups, including people with disabilities and immigrants, as well as occupation groups.

The role types of proportional legislators can be largely divided into the role of proxy agent and that of trustee. Here, the concept of representation is largely divided into official, technical, and practical representation. Also, their roles can be divided into five types depending on the legislator’s support base and political position in the party, namely, parliamentary role type, policy-making role type, type loyal to civic organizations, professional politician type, and constituency-based legislator type. While proportional legislators as proxy agents prioritise the local constituents who chose themselves, proportional legislators as trustees should place priority on the whole national interests when making policy decisions according to their professional convictions and empirical and conscientious judgments.

When it comes to representation, official representation acquires qualifications for representation by election procedures and methods. In this form, representation has structural and constitutional relationships between representatives and voters. In technical representation, representatives or representative organizations are related to the degree of reflecting characteristics of citizens, including race, economic classes, religions, and gender. In practical representation, representatives take actions in response to the interests of voters as political representatives.

In countries like Korea that adopt a closed list system, proportional legislators have greater roles as trustees than as representatives and have mixed roles of the two types. According to the study that applied the role types of legislators to the 17th-term legislators, female legislators gave higher points to ‘parliamentary/policy-making role type’ and ‘type loyal to the party/civic organizations’ than male legislators did. In the 17th-term National Assembly, assemblywomen were largely composed of those elected by proportional representation and the newly elected. For this reason, there was a noticeable difference between female and male lawmakers. After all, the gender differences in the role types of national assemblymen and assemblywomen were related to their recruited backgrounds.

2) Expected roles of proportional assemblywomen

Expected roles of proportional assemblywomen symbolize roles as representatives of diverse minority groups and at the same time the identities of the political parties. Ultimately, their expected roles are to speak for such diverse minority groups.

We analyzed whether there were differences in the policy interest and policy impact between constituency-based legislators and proportional legislators. According to the analysis, constituency-based legislators had relatively high interest in distribution policies related to the distribution of resources and budgets. On the other hand, proportional legislators showed relatively high interest in policies on women and families, health and welfare policies, and labor policies that have a strong character of welfare policies.

According to the empirical study on the legislative activity of the 17th-

term National Assembly, proportional legislators, largely comprising the newly-elected, proposed more bills than did constituency-based legislators. On the other hand, proportional legislators had lower passage rates of bills than constituency-based legislators because they had a limited influence on the passage of bills.

3) The subordinate hierarchical relationships between lawmakers in the National Assembly of Korea and the limitations of proportional representation

Korea's political system presupposes the subordinate hierarchical relationships between lawmakers elected in the local constituencies and those by proportional representation. Proportional legislators are experts who can perform legislative activity relatively free from the dilemma between their roles as the trustee and the mandator, and without the burden of activity in their constituencies. In spite of this, they cannot fully exhibit their competencies because proportional assemblywomen are in a situation where they should seek the constituencies they will run for the next election and prepare for the election in order to be reelected.

2. Pursuit of National Assemblywomen's Practical Representation and the Political Party's Control

1) National assemblywomen's practical representation

A series of academic studies explain that representation is not sufficient merely because representatives similar to the people or group to be represented exist in the parliament. In other words, promoting technical representation does not automatically lead to high representation and make women a political force in the assembly. Therefore, it is necessary

to discuss practical representation going beyond technical representation.

To raise the practical representation of women, female legislators should speak for women's diverse positions and opinions, and achieve practical representation as a process and result. For example, they should actively participate in discussion about bills, ask questions in the inspection of state administration from women's stance, or submit bills related to women. This is the meaning of female legislators practically representing women.

2) Party leadership's control and nominal feminization

Obstacles to practical representation of women can be defined from the following three aspects: i) nomination centered on the party leadership that results in nominal feminization, ii) putting stigma on female legislators elected by the quota system intended to marginalize them, and iii) the low proportion of female lawmakers that obscures their presence insignificant. Specifically, first, in the case of the legislative quota system or the quota system in the party, the party leadership may have stronger control in the process of preparing the party list. In this case, the nominating male party leadership's control over the nominated women and nominal feminization have the risk of becoming deeper and accelerated. Second, due to the stigma and preconceptions/prejudices against women who enter the assembly through the quota system, female legislators recruited by the quota system are marginalized while undergoing difficulties in playing a major role or occupying a leading position in the assembly. Third, due to the small number of assemblywomen, their voice may be ignored or silenced in a male-centered assembly culture.

3. Verification of Hypotheses on the Role Perceptions of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation

We established the following hypotheses to verify the role perceptions of national assemblywomen elected by proportional representation or proportional assemblywomen. To do so, we considered the role types of lawmakers and the sponsor-proxy agent relationships between legislators and voters, then applied the concept of pursuing practical representation in the political representation of women.

Hypothesis I: Proportional assemblywomen contribute to raising the ‘practical representation’ of women more than constituency-based assemblywomen do.

Hypothesis II: Proportional assemblywomen’s retaining political careers contradicts the pursuit of ‘practical representation of women.’

For these hypotheses, the proxy agent type –which should represent women’s interests – can be applied to proportional assemblywomen due to the gender quota system, while the trustee type to legislators’ autonomous activity type because there is no quota system in the constituencies.

III. Careers of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation and Legislative Activity for Practical Representation

1. Careers and Reelection of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation

The purpose of this section is to examine whether female legislators

practically speak for women's interests. To this end, we analyzed the overall legislative activity of female proportional representatives who entered the National Assembly under the 50-percent gender quota system for proportional representation candidates. The quota system was introduced in the elections for the 17th-term National Assembly.

To do so, we first examined characteristics of proportional assemblywomen through examination of their demographic backgrounds, then compared the aspects of legislative activity between them. Next, we selected assemblywomen who were reelected once or more and those who were elected in local constituencies to compare the aspects of legislative activity of proportional assemblywomen.

First, according to the examination of demographic and social backgrounds of proportional assemblywomen, their demographic and social backgrounds, including their age, personal history and expertise, acted as the primary criteria for judging whose interests they speak for in their legislative activity (Jeong-won Choi 2010; Jin-ok Lee, et al., 2017, requoted from p. 224). Proportional assemblywomen were groups who represented most whose ages were in their 40s to 50s, who held a higher degree from graduate schools or above, and who had a personal history of holding a party membership. When examined by age and profession, however, they did not have particular characteristics between the groups, except that the higher their education level was, the higher their legislative productivity.

After completing the term for proportional representation, proportional assemblywomen were continuously reelected in the local constituencies in many cases. Actually, of the 23 reelected constituency-based female legislators in the 20th National Assembly, 15 legislators began their political careers recruited by proportional representation, accounting for

65.2%.

On the other hand, while over 30 assemblywomen were first elected by proportional representation for respective National Assembly, there were many proportional assemblywomen who ended up serving one term only without winning the reelection. When we examined those who were in the line of the Democratic Party, a total of 34 national assemblywomen were newly elected by proportional representation in the 17th to 19th-term National Assembly, and of them, 24 legislators or 70.6% ended up their political career serving only the first term by proportional representation. When we examined those who were in the line of the Future Integration Party (currently, People's Power Party), a total of 48 national assemblywomen were first elected by proportional representation in the 17th to 19th-term National Assembly, and of them, 41 legislators or 87.2% ended their political career serving only the first term by proportional representation.

Although there are cases where national assemblywomen recruited by proportional representation continuously settle in the local constituencies, it is hard to say that this trend is solid enough to play a bridging role or catalyst role in a stable manner. The proportional representation system still has the constant problem that legislators recruited by the system end up serving only the first term.

Therefore, it is necessary to reinforce the bridging role or catalyst role of the quota system and the proportional representation system in order to secure quantitative representation by making women a political force. It is also necessary to prepare ways of securing practical representation going beyond quantitative representation by fully exercising their competencies in the assembly as legislators based on their experiences and careers.

Since the 17th-term National Assembly, more than 25 female proportional representatives have been steadily secured. In this situation, the number of the standing committees in which they participated has evenly expanded since the 17th-term National Assembly. On the other hand, their participation in the major position like committee chair or secretary was not enough, and the area of participation also was limited to the Committee on Women and Families or the Committee on Health and Welfare.

2. Comparison of the 20th-term National Assemblywomen's Legislative Activity and Practical Representation

Newly-elected assemblywomen had better productivity than the reelected. The newly-elected by proportional representation proposed 90.1 cases per person, and all the newly-elected assemblywomen proposed 90.7 cases per person. Compared to the reelected assemblywomen who proposed 82.7 bills per person, newly-elected assemblywomen were actively engaged in proposing bills.

As for gender equality agendas, the newly-elected by proportional representation submitted 13.8 cases per person, and all the newly-elected assemblywomen submitted 13.5 cases per person, while the reelected submitted 9.2 cases per person. The type of assemblywomen who passed most cases of bills per person was the newly elected in the local constituencies, passing 9.3 bills, followed by the newly elected by proportional representation, 6.0 bills. The reelected assemblywomen passed only a small number of cases per person, half the bills the newly elected passed per person. Those first elected by proportional representation and reelected in the local constituencies passed 3.7 cases

per person. Also, those first elected and reelected in the local constituencies passed 2.4 cases per person. In the case of proposing yet disposing bills after reflecting alternatives, the newly elected proposed 23.9 bills, more than 20.0 bills proposed by the reelected.

Assemblywomen who experienced proportional representation had better productivity than those who experienced local constituencies. The former assemblywomen proposed 86.9 bills and the latter 87.9 cases per person. Although the latter proposed about a bill per person more than the former, the difference was insignificant. Regarding gender equality agendas, the former assemblywomen showed a higher interest in the issue, proposing 12.6 cases per person, compared to 8.0 cases per person by the latter assemblywomen. When it comes to passing the bills, the former assemblywomen passed 5.2 cases per person, and proposed yet disposed 23.1 bills after reflecting alternatives, while the latter passed 4.3 cases per person, and proposed yet disposed 18.8 bills after reflecting alternatives.

Of the total 4,451 bills, 594 bills or 13.3% were classified as gender equality agendas.

When gender equality agendas were examined by theme, agendas on violence against women accounted for the largest portion of 309 cases, followed by 88 cases on support for work-family reconciliation. This is assumed to have reflected the social environment where gender safety is insecure and the realities where support for work-family reconciliation is not sufficient enough to meet the needs arising from women's increasing participation in economic activity.

〈Current status of proposing bills on gender equality agendas by the type of the 20th-term National Assemblywomen〉

[Unit: person, case (number of cases per person)]

		Newly Elected in the 20 th -term National Assembly			Reelected in the 20 th -term National Assembly			Total
		Proportional representation	local constituency	sub-total	proportional/ local	local/ local	sub-total	
No. of assemblywomen		25	3	28	15	8	23	51
gender equality agendas	job/ women's labor	32 (1.3)	4 (1.3)	36 (1.3)	5 (0.3)	2 (0.3)	7 (0.3)	43 (0.8)
	violence against women	165 (6.6)	20 (6.7)	185 (6.6)	85 (5.7)	39 (4.9)	124 (5.4)	309 (6.1)
	political participation/ governance, participation by gender	26 (1.0)	6 (2.0)	32 (1.1)	19 (1.3)	2 (0.3)	21 (0.9)	53 (1.0)
	support for work-family reconciliation	58 (2.3)	1 (0.3)	59 (2.1)	24 (1.6)	5 (0.6)	29 (1.3)	88 (1.7)
	multicultural families	2 (0.1)	0 (0.0)	2 (0.1)	1 (0.1)	0 (0.0)	1 (0.0)	3 (0.1)
	women's welfare	38 (1.5)	0 (0.0)	38 (1.4)	13 (0.9)	5 (0.6)	18 (0.8)	56 (1.1)
	other	25 (1.0)	2 (0.7)	27 (1.0)	9 (0.6)	2 (0.3)	11 (0.5)	38 (0.7)
Total		346 (13.8)	33 (11.0)	379 (13.5)	156 (10.4)	55 (6.9)	211 (9.2)	590 (11.6)

Source: National Assembly of Korea, Bill Information System
 (<https://likms.assembly.go.kr/bill/main.do>
 last search date: 09.30.2020.). Reconstructed.

When we examined the current status of proposing bills on gender equality agendas by the vocational group of assemblywomen, the vocational group with the most cases per person was the group that belonged to the vocational group for women and families. This group proposed 112.4 cases per person, and of this, 20.4 cases per person were on gender equality agendas, making up the largest portion of the agendas.

When listed by the occupational group in the descending order, the group for women and families proposed 20.4 cases, the group for science and information and communications technology (ICT) 18.0 cases, the group for education 8.7 cases, the group for health and welfare 8.3 cases, the group for environment and labor 8.0 cases, the group for land and transportation 3.0 cases, the group for other 2.6 cases, the group for information and the press 2.5 cases.

3. Legislative Activity in the 17th to 19th-term National Assembly by Female Legislators Reelected Once or More in the 20th-term National Assembly

We surveyed female legislators who were reelected once or more in the 20th-term National Assembly to examine whether there was any difference in their interest in gender equality agendas from the time they entered the National Assembly to the present.

According to the survey, over all, the newly elected by proportional representation actually took more interest in agendas on women than the newly elected in the local constituencies did. In the case of the newly elected by proportional representation, they proposed 22 cases of agendas on women, accounting for 13.3% of the total 166 cases of bills proposed in the 17th-term National Assembly. The proportion of proposed agendas

on women made up 10.9% in the 18th-term National Assembly, 22.6% in the 19th-term National Assembly, and 16.1% in the 20th-term National Assembly. In the case of the newly elected in the local constituencies, the proportion of proposed agendas on women accounted for 0.0% in the 17th-term National Assembly, 7.7% in the 19th-term National Assembly, and 11.7% in the 20th-term National Assembly. Because we have not surveyed all the national assemblywomen by the term of all national assemblies, these figures do not show tendencies throughout all the periods of National Assembly. Nevertheless, they show the differences of the actual interest in women during the first term by national assemblywomen reelected once or more in the 20th-term National Assembly.

Except for the type of the newly elected in the local constituencies in the 17th-term National Assembly which has only one legislator by type, it was found that the newly elected by proportional representation were actually more interested in agendas on women than the newly elected in the local constituencies did. This can be interpreted as a result of meeting the demand and expectation of national assemblywomen, particularly of proportional assemblywomen to practically represent women since the introduction of the 50-percent gender quota system for proportional representation candidates in the 17th-term National Assembly.

We quantitatively examined the gender equality agendas from the 17th to the 20th-term National Assembly proposed by 21 legislators who were reelected once or more in the 20th-term National Assembly. According to the results of the quantitative examination, these reelected assemblywomen tended to take less interest in gender equality agendas than they did at the time of entering the assembly, and generally so, as they were reelected over and over again. There were only a few

exceptions to this tendency, such as the group of lawmakers for education who entered the 19th-term National Assembly, the group for environment and labor who entered the 17th-term National Assembly, and the overall groups for women and families.

〈Current status of proposing bills on gender equality agendas by the former career of national assemblywomen reelected once or more in the 20th-term National Assembly〉

[Unit: cases (%)]

Function	Entry	No. of assemblywomen	17 th term		18 th term		19 th term		20 th term		Total	
			gender equality	total	gender equality	total	gender equality	total	gender equality	total	gender equality	total
Education	17 th											
	18 th											
	19 th	1					0 (0.0)	41	3 (6.4)	47	3 (3.4)	88
	total	1					0 (0.0)	41	3 (6.4)	47	3 (3.4)	88
Health and welfare	17 th											
	18 th	2			10 (5.7)	176			8 (3.1)	258	18 (4.1)	434
	19 th	1					16 (11.7)	137	10 (6.8)	147	26 (9.2)	284
	total	3			10 (5.7)	176	16 (11.7)	137	18 (4.4)	405	44 (6.1)	718
Environment and labor	17 th	2	3 (4.3)	70			6 (7.3)	82	4 (4.3)	94	13 (5.3)	246
	18 th											
	19 th	1					8 (15.4)	52	14 (10.0)	140	22 (11.5)	192
	total	3	3 (4.3)	70			14 (10.4)	134	18 (7.7)	234	35 (8.0)	438

Function	Entry	No. of assembly women	17 th term		18 th term		19 th term		20 th term		Total	
			gender equality	total	gender equality	total	gender equality	total	gender equality	total	gender equality	total
Information and the press	17 th	2	7 (18.9)	37	2 (4.3)	46	4 (4.4)	90	4 (6.7)	60	17 (7.3)	233
	18 th											
	19 th											
	total	2	7 (18.9)	37	2 (4.3)	46	4 (4.4)	90	4 (6.7)	60	17 (7.3)	233
Women and families	17 th	2	9 (28.1)	32	10 (21.3)	47	25 (27.8)	90	31 (19.4)	160	75 (22.8)	329
	18 th	1			14 (25.5)	55	28 (26.4)	106	24 (16.4)	146	66 (21.5)	307
	19 th	4					66 (16.8)	392	93 (18.1)	514	159 (17.5)	906
	total	7	9 (28.1)	32	24 (23.5)	102	119 (20.2)	588	148 (18.0)	820	300 (19.5)	1542
Other	17 th	2	3 (4.3)	69	0 (0.0)	77	2 (50.0)	4	11 (16.2)	68	16 (7.3)	218
	18 th	1			6 (14.0)	43			0 (0.0)	23	6 (9.1)	66
	19 th	2					5 (4.1)	122	6 (3.6)	168	11 (3.8)	290
	total	5	3 (4.3)	69	6 (5.0)	120	7 (5.6)	126	17 (6.6)	259	33 (5.7)	574

Source: National Assembly of Korea, Bill Information System
 (<https://likms.assembly.go.kr/bill/main.do>
 last search date: 09.30.2020.). Reconstructed.

4. Findings and Implications

National assemblywomen with experience of proportional representation were found to have taken more interest in gender equality agendas than national assemblywomen with experience of local constituencies only.

This finding may present the basis for presuming the presence of proportional assemblywomen as a foothold for achieving the goal of strengthening ‘good representation.’ Here, good representation can be secured through the proportional representation system and the composition of the gender-balanced national assembly, from which the necessity for the quota system emerged.

Although female legislators should not necessarily represent women only, the goal of the quota system is to resolve the issue of underrepresentation of women. Considering the goal of the system, female legislators who entered the National Assembly through the system should not ignore the demand from the voters that they do activities, to some degree, to expand the effect of the system.

IV. Survey Analysis of National Assemblywomen’s Backgrounds to Political Participation and their Roles

1. Survey Overview

Korea has recently witnessed the limitations of national assemblywomen’s representation of women, political activity, and expansion of gender politics. In this situation, we conducted a survey of national assemblywomen, women’s organizations and experts to analyze the

functions and roles of proportional assemblywomen from the perspective of women's political participation and political force-making. The analysis of the survey aims to provide the necessary rudimentary data for developing ways of improvement to secure proportional assemblywomen's practical representation.

As for the subjects of the survey, national assemblywomen were selected from the data on the national assemblywomen from the 15th to 20th-term National Assembly provided by Korea Women Parliamentarian Network. Women's organizations and civic groups were surveyed from the organizations registered at the Ministry of Gender Equality and Families and the Ministry of the Interior and Safety. Experts, including professors and researchers, were limited to politics and public administration.

Regarding the survey methods, we conducted the survey based on structured questionnaire together with a direct visit survey, mail survey, and email survey from June 22, 2020 to August 31, 2020.

2. Political Careers and Roles of Proportional Assemblywomen

We analyzed the survey of political careers and roles of proportional assemblywomen largely by dividing them into i) the reasons for running for the National Assembly elections, ii) factors for nominating national assemblywomen, iii) expected roles of national assemblywomen, and iv) the impact of the 50-percent gender quota system on proportional assemblywomen.

First, regarding the reasons for running for the elections, the largest response was recommendation by their parties. However, while 48.6% of proportional assemblywomen were recommended by their parties,

33.3% of constituency-based assemblywomen ran for the office of their own volition.

Second, regarding the factors nominating for national assemblywomen, over all, political representation (78.0%) and policy expertise (72.0%) acted as the biggest factors. It was also analyzed that women's organizations and experts placed more emphasis on political representation (87.6%) than policy expertise (58.8%).

Third, according to the result of surveying the expected roles of national assemblywomen, national assemblywomen themselves put stress on "legislative activity, including proposing women-related policies and bills (4.34 points on a 5-point Likert scale)," "the role of establishing a gender equal culture in the National Assembly and the political parties (4.18 points)," and "activity of preparing and passing bills, including proposing bills (4.12 points)." On the other hand, proportional assemblywomen had low perceptions that their roles were distinctive from those of constituency-based national assemblywomen, and that they had the role of continually developing their careers after serving their term as proportional representatives. However, the group of national assemblywomen who experienced local constituencies after proportional representation had high perceptions of their different roles from those of proportional assemblywomen and of the role of continually developing their careers. Women's organizations and experts gave high average points to such responses as "women-related policy and legislative activity (4.50 points)," "the role of establishing a gender equal culture in the National Assembly and the political parties (4.45 points)," "activity of preparing and passing bills, including proposing bills (4.10 points)," and "taking the lead in representing women's interests when their party opinions and women's interests are in conflict (4.05 points)." Compared

to national assemblywomen themselves, women's organizations and experts had high tendencies of perceiving that proportional assemblywomen's roles were to continuously develop their careers and to speak for women as well.

Fourth, according to the results of surveying the impact of the 50-percent quota system on proportional assemblywomen, the largest proportion of the assemblywomen themselves, women's organizations, and experts all answered that "even if they were elected by the 50-percent quota for female candidates, they have only to do legislative activity capitalizing on their expertise, including legislative activity for women." However, a high proportion of civic groups replied that "although they were elected by the 50-percent quota for female candidates, they do not have the duty to do legislative activity for women." That is, civic organizations perceived the impact of the gender quota system as relatively limited to winning the election only.

3. Policy Interest

We examined policy interest largely by dividing it into i) the themes national assemblywomen focused on, ii) interest in raising women's human rights and gender issues, iii) stances toward women-related current issues, and iv) experience of taking a position in the party.

First, according to the results of surveying national assemblywomen to examine the themes they focused on during legislative activity, national assemblywomen's legislative activity was limited to particular areas. In other words, while they showed high interest in women and families, education, and health and welfare, they had very low interest in legislation and judiciary, the state affairs, and information.

Second, their interest in women's human rights and gender issues was surveyed to be very high. As ways of developing women's human rights and gender issues during their legislative activity, they used lawmaking activities, including proposing bills, and interpellation or inspection of state administration more than party opinions or networking with civic and women's organizations.

Third, regarding women-related pending issues during the 20th-term National Assembly, they took affirmative stances toward most of the issues. In particular, the highest proportion, or 90.0% of the assemblywomen voted for the Framework Act on the Prevention of Violence Against Women and the 30-percent gender quota for local constituencies.

Fourth, according to the survey of national assemblywomen regarding whether they experienced any position in the party during their first term, a high proportion of the respondents, or 90.0% of national assemblywomen answered in the affirmative. This implies that female legislators' status in the party is improving. We also analyzed the impact of national assemblywomen's experience of taking a position in the party during the first term on their legislative activity. According to the results of the analysis, their experience had a high impact on "improving their recognition (4.12 points)," "securing supporters in the party (3.81 points)," "lawmaking activity in accordance to the party opinion (3.75 points)," and "legislative activity based on their own convictions (3.66 points)" in that order. But it had the lowest impact on nomination of candidates (3.21 points). Also, the experience of proportional assemblywomen's taking a position in the party had a greater impact on their legislative activity than that of constituency-based assemblywomen. In addition, we surveyed women's organizations and experts to analyze

the impact of assemblywomen's experience of taking a position in the party during the first term on their legislative activity. According to the results of the analysis, the respondents were highly aware of the positive impact of the experience on the legislative activity. This was found in their responses to "improving their recognition (4.43 points)," nomination for the next election (4.30 points)," "securing supporters in the party (4.08 points)," "lawmaking activity in accordance to the party opinion (3.89 points)," and "legislative activity based on their own convictions (3.89 points)."

4. Satisfaction with Legislative Activity and Limitations

We examined satisfaction with legislative activity and limitations by dividing them into i) satisfaction with performing their roles, ii) limitations of performing their roles, and iii) needs for creating a policy environment for developing agendas on women.

First, in the case of satisfaction with performing their roles we surveyed assemblywomen to examine the satisfaction during their legislative activity. According to the results of the survey, they were highly satisfied with "exhibiting their expertise in their professional area through the activity in the standing committees of the National Assembly (4.12 points)" and "the activity of preparing and passing the bills, including proposing bills (3.84 points)." On the other hand, they were relatively less satisfied with networking, that is, promoting relationships with voters and civic groups. According to the results of surveying women's organizations and experts to analyze national assemblywomen's satisfaction with performing their roles during legislative activity, the average point was, over all, lower than 3.3 points. More than anything

else, women's organizations and experts made widely different assessments of official activities from that of national assemblywomen. This was seen in their responses to “exhibiting their expertise in their professional area through the activity in the standing committees of the National Assembly (3.02 points)” and “the activity of preparing and passing the bills, including proposing bills (3.01 points).”

Second, we surveyed national assemblywomen to examine the limitations they experienced while performing their roles during their legislative activity. According to the survey results, it is presumed that national assemblywomen were assigned to the standing committees befitting their expertise. In other words, the average point was highest, at 4.06 points, for the limitation they experienced “when the National Assembly was operated in a disruptive manner,” but lowest at 2.63 points “when they were assigned to standing committees unrelated to their expertise.” Also, the impact of gender discriminative factors in the parties mitigated as found from the average points of lower than 3 points for limitations as women, exclusion from main positions, and alienation from networking.

Third, according to the results of examining the need for creating a policy environment for developing agendas on women, a very high proportion of both national assemblywomen, women's organization and experts, or 90% or over answered that it was necessary to create such environment. In particular, national assemblywomen with experience of proportional representation only had a higher demand than those with constituency-based assemblywomen. Also, women's organizations had a relatively higher demand than the academic community and civic groups. Subsequently, we surveyed ways of supporting the creation of a policy environment for developing agendas on women. The survey showed that

“effort and practice to increase the number of assemblywomen” accounted for the largest proportion of responses, at 58.0%, followed by “budget support for developing women-related legislation and research” at 40.0%. On the other hand, women’s organizations and experts showed the highest demand, or 40.4%, for “organizing a forum consisting of male and female lawmakers focusing on women-related legislative agendas,” followed by “budget support for developing women-related legislation and research” at 38.5%. Women’s organizations and experts had twice higher perceptions than national assemblywomen that both male and female legislators should participate in developing agendas on women.

5. Perceptions of the Gender Quota System and Representation of Women

We examined the perceptions of the gender quota system and representation of women by dividing into i) expansion of activity in women's organizations and representation of women, ii) the quota system, iii) women’s political force-making, and iv) changes arising from the increase in the number of female legislators.

First, national assemblywomen, women's organizations and experts all perceived the quota system for women as necessary. They perceived that it was necessary to maintain the quota system to expand women’s political participation, which they assessed as an achievement of Korean women’s movement.

Second, regarding the necessity of introducing the quota system for youth and social minorities other than for women, women's organizations and experts had higher perceptions than national assemblywomen.

According to the survey of the essential purpose of introducing the quota system for women, the highest proportion of responses from national assemblywomen, women's organizations and experts all was “to expand legislation of agendas on women by expanding the number of female lawmakers.”

Third, we surveyed female legislators to grasp the meaning of making women a political force. The survey showed that the largest proportion of them, or 50.0%, answered that it meant “institutionalizing women-related and social minority issues,” followed by 48.0% “institutionalizing women-related issues.” Also, in perceiving women’s political force-making, women's organizations and experts put more stress on “representing women and social minorities,” accounting for 61.8% of the responses, than “institutionalizing women-related issues” (36.5%).

Fourth, when we examined the appropriate gender ratio of legislators, the highest proportion of assemblywomen, women's organizations and experts all answered that the ratio was about 50%. According to the survey of changes arising from the increase in the number of female legislators, the highest proportion of responses included “gender equality-related bills increased in the national assembly” and “relationships between assemblywomen and women's organizations or the academic community increased.” As mentioned earlier in the measurement of national assemblywomen’s satisfaction with their legislative activity, they were slightly satisfied with building relationships with women's organizations and voters. Considering this, female lawmakers continue to make efforts to form networks with women's organizations and other organizations, but its effectiveness is still insignificant. In addition, we surveyed changes arising from the increase

in the number of female legislators as women's organizations and experts perceived them. As a result, we judged that there were differences in the perceived concept and scope of gender equality between national assemblywomen and women's organizations and experts.

6. Proportional Assemblywomen's Experience of Legislative Activity and Determination to Continue Careers

We examined proportional assemblywomen's experience of legislative activity and determination to continue careers by dividing into i) advantages or disadvantages of activity as female proportional legislators, ii) choice when stances of their functions, parties, and women were in conflict, iii) determination to continue their careers, and intention to continue or resume political careers, iv) factors necessary for making women a political force, and v) matters to improve in operating the proportional representation system.

First, national assemblywomen thought they had advantages in conducting legislative activity as proportional female lawmakers, while women's organizations and experts thought proportional female lawmakers were advantageous in gaining access to information.

Second, according to the survey of their choice when stances of their functions, parties, and women were in conflict, the highest proportion of them responded that they made a choice from a women's stance. This tendency was stronger with assemblywomen who had political careers of being reelected once or more compared to the newly-elected.

Third, we surveyed the level of aspiration for political career when they received nomination for proportional representation. According to the survey results, the highest proportion of them responded that they

would continue their political careers using the opportunity of receiving nomination for proportional legislators. Female lawmakers with constituency-based careers had higher aspirations for maintaining their political careers than assemblywomen with careers of proportional representatives only. When it comes to the intention of continuing or resuming political careers, 41.9% of the respondents answered in the affirmative to the question whether they will continue or resume their political careers, while 41.9% in the negative. If they experienced being constituency-based assemblywomen, the proportion of their intention to continue political careers was higher than that of those who did not.

Fourth, according to the examination of factors necessary for making women a political force, assemblywomen emphasized relationships with key forces in the party (25.7%) and introduction of the 30-percent quota system to constituencies (22.9%). The highest proportion, or 33.0%, of assemblywomen with experience of proportional representation only responded that relationships with key forces in the party were the factor necessary to be nominated, while the highest proportion, or 37.5%, of assemblywomen with experience of local constituencies answered that the factor was to develop local constituencies. This implies that dedication to activities of establishing a foothold in the party and developing local constituencies to get nominated may have a negative impact on performing legislative activity. On the other hand, women's organizations and experts answered “improving expertise through legislative activity (24.7%)” and “introducing the 30-percent quota system for women to constituencies (20.6%),” focusing on expertise of individual assemblywomen.

Fifth and last, according to the analysis of matters to improve in operating the proportional representation system, a high proportion of

assemblywomen responded to the question about introducing a two-term system for proportional assemblywomen. Lawmakers with experience of proportional representation only preferred to improve the operation system through connecting the two-term system and expertise, while those who experienced local constituency as well preferred nomination for constituencies based on the objective assessment of their legislative activity. Women's organizations and experts put more stress on expertise-based continuation of political careers than assemblywomen. The former group showed a higher proportion of responses to application of principles for allocating assemblywomen to the standing committees related to the area of their specialties and careers (52.4%) and nomination with priority to advantageous constituencies for reelection according to the objective assessment of their legislative activity (22.9%).

V. Overseas Cases

1. Cases of Nomination for Women in the Proportional Representation System Combined with the Quota System

1) Italy

Italy applied the quota system in the proportional representation system for the first time in 1994. Female legislators elected by proportional representation were more or less young, inexperienced in local governments, and low in the proportion of the highly educated. Regarding the number of proposed bills, proportional female representatives showed poor performances and rather low reelection rates. They depended on the party leadership for nomination for proportional representation because Italy adopts the sponsor system for

nomination by the party. Also, female proportional lawmakers were poor in the performance of legislative activity because their status was low with the proportional representation seats accounting for a mere 24.6% of the total parliamentary seats.

2) Germany

Female legislators elected by proportional representation were slightly young and inexperienced with politics in some cases. However, in legislation activity, they were active in frequently spending time on voicing their opinions, took feminist attitudes, and tended to vote for women.

As Germany adopts the party nomination system in a strictly bureaucratic manner, proportional female members of federal parliament are free from the influence of the party leadership, hence they have no reason for depending on the party leadership. Also, there is no difference in the status between proportional and constituency seats because the proportional seats are theoretically the same in number with the constituency-based seats. In addition, because Germany allows multiple nominations, a growing number of women as well have been multiply nominated.

3) Mexico

The application of the quota system is different from state to state in Mexico. As such, we compared the legislative activity of proportional state assemblywomen in two states: Zacatecas makes it mandatory to apply the quota system, while Michoacán recommends applying the quota system.

Female legislators elected by the quota system are heavily controlled by the party leadership in their legislative activity. Also, when assigned to standing committees, they are tacitly pressured by the party to apply to particular committees.

Because the party nomination process is centered on the party leadership, women elected by the quota are pressured to follow the opinion of the party leadership that nominated them even after winning the election, or to act for the interests of their party.

4) Sub-Conclusions and Implications

The autonomy of quota-based legislators' legislative activity is closely related to the party's nomination process. The nomination system without pressure from the party leadership can raise the autonomy and independence of the female legislators elected by the quota system if the nomination process is not bureaucratic.

The legislative activity of quota-based legislators has something to do with the status itself of proportional assemblywomen. The status itself is affected by the proportion of proportional representation seats to the total parliamentary seats. As such, the lower the proportion of the proportional representation seats in the legislature is, the lower their status may be. This is the case with Italy, where the proportion of the proportional representation seats stands at 24.6% and thus the status of female proportional members of parliament is slightly low. On the other hand, as Germany has theoretically the same seats for proportional representation as constituency-based seats, the status of female proportional members of parliament is not low.

2. Cases of Caucuses for Female Legislators

1) The United States

The Congressional Caucus for Women's Issues (CCWI) of the United States was formed by the women of the House of Representatives as a bipartisan membership organization committed to advancing women's interests in Congress in 1977. CCWI has since taken bipartisanship as its basic mission and principle to date.

In order to expand issues, CCWI today uses efforts to maintain political bipartisanship as the founding principle for this organization, efforts to symbolically represent women, and events related to women's interests. CCWI takes the strategy of diversifying disruptive issues like women's abortion rather than directly addressing them to reduce controversy. It also takes the strategy of developing such issues as sustainable issues that can be regarded as women's interests and have an administrative structure as well.

2) Ireland

The Irish Women's Parliamentary Caucus was formed as a bipartisan forum for Irish congresswomen in 2017. The caucus has since exerted efforts to discuss and develop issues that affect women. In 2018, the caucus hosted the International Congress of Parliamentary Women's Caucuses, in which over 40 countries participated.

3) Sub-Conclusions and Implications

Seen from globally, both cases coexist with each other where women's caucuses succeeded in making gender issues and gender equality agendas

and legislating the agendas on the one hand, and where countries contend they achieved women's political force-making without forming women's caucuses, on the other hand. Likewise, the meaning and value of women's caucus can be different according to the political environment of each country.

In the case of Korea, one of the reasons for the absence of women's caucus may be that the imperativeness of gender equality issues is not sufficiently recognised in the National Assembly. Therefore, both male and female legislators should first take more interest in gender equality issues before intending to form a women's caucus, and at the same time, prepare a thorough strategy for overcoming the limitations of the current partisan politics.

VI. Conclusions and Implications

1. Verification of Hypotheses through the Research

Hypothesis I: Proportional assemblywomen contribute to raising the 'practical representation' of women more than constituency-based assemblywomen do.

When we applied the research results to Hypothesis I, it was analyzed that proportional assemblywomen were far more sensitive to and empathetic toward issues of practical representation than constituency-based national assemblywomen. Also, when we examined assemblywomen's legislative activity patterns, the newly elected assemblywomen and those with experience of proportional representation had higher legislative productivity than those reelected and those without experience of proportional representation, respectively. The group of

assemblywomen who experienced proportional representation proposed bills on gender equality agendas 4.6 cases per person more than those who did not. Regarding the expected roles of proportional assemblywomen, proportional assemblywomen had a great expectation of i) legislative activity, including proposing women-related policies and bills, ii) establishing a gender equal culture in the National Assembly and the political parties together with women-related legislative activity, and iii) normative roles, including nationwide activity, that go beyond the interests of local constituencies.

Hypothesis II: Proportional assemblywomen's retaining political careers contradicts the pursuit of 'practical representation of women.'

This hypothesis was wrong because when we compared policy interest in gender equality agendas between the group of assemblywomen who experienced proportional representation and the group who did not, the group of constituency-based assemblywomen who experienced proportional representation proposed more gender equality agendas than the group of constituency-based assemblywomen who did not. Not only in the number of cases of proposing gender equality agendas, but also in the maximum value of proposing gender equality agendas were there differences. In other words, the maximum value of proposing gender equality agendas per person was 44 cases for the newly elected in the 20th-term National Assembly, and 46 cases for the constituency-based assemblywomen who experienced proportional representation among the reelected once or more. This shows that proportional assemblywomen are by far more actively engaged in legislative activity compared to 23 cases for the newly elected in the local constituencies and 17 cases for the reelected in the local constituencies after serving as constituency-based assemblywomen.

2. Status and Limitations of National Assemblywomen Elected by Proportional Representation

1) Relationships with women's organizations

It was presumed that satisfaction with assemblywomen's roles was low because of the low efficacy of the quota system achieved by the women's movement. In reality, only a small proportion of women's organizations saw the quota system as an achievement of the women's movement. On the contrary, assemblywomen perceived the quota system as an achievement of the women's movement.

When we analyzed satisfaction with performing assemblywomen's roles, national assemblywomen themselves were most satisfied with the role of exhibiting their expertise. Women's organizations and experts responded that they were most satisfied with assemblywomen's role of promoting relationships with women's organizations and civic groups, followed by their role of proposing and passing women-related bills, exhibiting expertise at the standing committees, and preparing and passing bills in that order.

The level of satisfaction was also different from position to position. Seen from the positions of assemblywomen and women's and civic organizations, satisfaction of assemblywomen themselves was much higher than that of the organizations. Assemblywomen showed the highest satisfaction with their activities in the standing committees where they could capitalize on their expertise. On the other hand, from the positions of women's and civic organizations, they showed high satisfaction with assemblywomen's enhancing relationships with women's and civic organizations. This difference in satisfaction seems to have occurred because the organizations did not have opportunities

to assess assemblywomen's activities inside the standing committees that are not disclosed to the public.

2) Relationships with political parties

Both legislators and those involved in the National Assembly uniformly pointed out the low status and limitations of proportional assemblywomen in the parties. Proportional representatives perceived that the limitation of 'proportional' representation was greater than the limitation of 'women.'

With regard to proportional assemblywomen's career retention, there was a significant difference in the perceptions of factors for being nominated between assemblywomen and women's organizations. Former and current assemblywomen who were newly elected by proportional representation and former and current assemblywomen who experienced proportional representation and then local constituencies perceived that what was most important for being nominated for reelection was to develop local constituencies and to build relationships with key forces in the party. On the other hand, women's organizations and experts chose 'legislative activity' most and 'developing local constituencies' least for their answers. This reveals that women's organizations and experts actually did not have a realistic urgency for assemblywomen to retain their careers as constituency-based assemblywomen. In reality, the achievements of legislative activity are not reflected in nomination at all. Given this reality, these responses of the organizations and experts reveal the wide difference in positions as they have not considered the nomination process in political reality at all.

3. Conclusions and Implications

First, this study started from the critical assessment of proportional assemblywomen, but then the study found that the experience of proportional representation had a significant impact on both newly-elected and reelected assemblywomen. As such, it can be said that the proportional representation system is highly effective on women's political participation.

Second, the relationships between proportional assemblywomen and women's organizations have been formed as the relationships between sponsors and proxy agents over the past two decades. As of 2020, however, Korea's gender equality topography is transformed to a very different shape compared to 2004. Therefore, it is necessary to break away from the past relationships between sponsors and proxy agents.

Third, as for proportional assemblywomen's status and career retention, it is important for them to perform a normative role of expanding a gender equal culture by carrying through gender equality agendas and changing male lawmakers. But they should not view the continuation of political careers from conflicting perspectives.

Fourth, for proportional assemblywomen to pursue practical representation, the structure of political opportunity is fairly important. The reality is that the party's nomination process is male-centered and the decision-making power is concentrated on the party leadership. Therefore, it is necessary to recognize that this reality is a disadvantageous structure to women. It is also an important variable to freely discuss women-related issues in the political realm, including the National Assembly, and to prepare a platform to discuss women-related issues. At present, Korea's Gender Equality and Family Committee in

the National Assembly works, even if weakly, as the foundation for performing this role.

Last, if that is the case, it is necessary to find answers to the following questions: what does women's political representation mean at the juncture of year 2020? Here, who or what do women mean? Female candidates for proportional representation have gradually focused on expertise in diverse areas, but the gender quota system basically aims at legislative activity to resolve women's issues and to accomplish gender equality. When these definitions are met, it can be said that the system contributes to women's political representation. Women who voice diverse opinions should become spokespersons for the institutionalized laws and policies and become the force to drive them forward.

