

2019

Research Paper-07



A Gender-sensitive Analysis of Government Projects in Culture and Tourism and Its Implications for Improving Their Efficiency

Young-Sook Kim
Hyo-Joo Kim
Kiwon Hong
Byeong-Kwon Kim
Ju-Yeon Jung



Korean Women's Development Institute



A gender-sensitive analysis of government projects in culture and tourism and its implications for improving their efficiency

©2019

Korean Women's Development Institute

225 Jinheung-ro Eunpyeong-gu

Seoul 03367

Korea

www.kwdi.re.kr

Contents

I . Introduction	1
II . Gender equality issues and status of government projects in the culture and tourism area.	2
III . Case Analysis	10

Tables

〈Table 1〉	Contents of the Delphi Survey	3
〈Table 2〉	Government Projects in the Culture & Tourism Area	7
〈Table 3〉	Budgets for Each Gender Equality Issue in the Culture & Tourism Area	9
〈Table 4〉	Examples of Project which Need to Prepare Gender Budget Statements	10

A gender-sensitive analysis of government projects in culture and tourism and its implications for improving their efficiency

Young-Sook Kim

Hyo-Joo Kim

Kiwon Hong

Byeong-Kwon Kim

Ju-Yeon Jung

I . Introduction

From the perspective of gender equality, the use of female resources and their career development in the culture and tourism industry face more obstacles than in other industries. With a look at quantitative statistics, however, it can be easily found that female-dominated jobs are concentrated in the culture and tourism industry. Such female dominance forms a perception that females have more advantage than males, which makes gender equality issues look vague in the culture and tourism industry.

This study analyzed government projects and expenditures in the culture and tourism area from a gender-sensitive perspective in order to understand how project efficiency is affected by reducing gender inequality in female-dominated areas.

The purpose of this study was 1) to identify gender equality issues in the culture and tourism industry through a Delphi survey and based

on which, look for culture and tourism projects which currently have no gender budget statement but need to do; and 2) to conduct a gender-sensitive analysis of government projects in the culture and tourism area based on the identified gender equality issues with an intention to present the effects of gender budgeting in terms of not only gender equality but also project efficiency. The case analysis was performed by means of a quantitative analysis of related data and a focused group interview (FGI).

Therefore, this study is mainly divided into two parts: Part 2 Gender equality issues and status of government projects in the culture and tourism area and Part 3 Gender-sensitive analysis of government projects in the culture and tourism area. The results and implications of each analysis are summarized as follows:

II . Gender equality issues and status of government projects in the culture and tourism area.

For this study, a Delphi survey of experts was conducted to identify gender equality issues prior to a gender-sensitive analysis of government projects in the culture and tourism area. Two rounds of the survey was conducted during the period of April 24 to May 19, 2018 (1st round: April 24 to 30, 2nd round: May 10 to 18), targeting 21 experts in the culture and tourism area. In the first round survey, expert opinions on gender-sensitive access as well as gender equality issues in the culture and tourism area were collected, and in the second round, experts were asked about the directions of gender-sensitive budgeting with consideration of gender equality issues identified in the culture and tourism area.

〈Table 1〉 Contents of the Delphi Survey

Survey	Descriptions	
	Section	Questions
1 st round	Presented gender-segregated statistics	
	1. Gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Level of adequacy of gender-sensitive perspective incorporated in the culture and tourism area (3 questions) • Level of necessity of incorporation of gender factors in the culture and tourism area (1 question) • Statement on benefits from incorporation of gender factors in the culture and tourism area
	2. Gender equality issues in culture and tourism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender equality issues identified from gender-segregated statistics presented (Open question) • Gender equality issues other than ones identified from gender-segregated statistics (Open question)
2 nd round	Presented the results of the first round survey and the results of analyzing project budgets for each gender equality issue	
	1. Gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Level of adequacy of gender-sensitive perspective incorporated in the culture and tourism area (3 questions) • Level of necessity of incorporation of gender factors in the culture and tourism area (2 questions) • Level of adequacy of gender-sensitive perspective incorporated in the policy and resource distribution in the culture and tourism area (11 questions)
	2. Gender equality issues in culture and tourism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Level of importance and priority (6 questions) of each gender equality issue • Timeliness (6 questions) and priority of each gender equality issue
	3. Gender-sensitive budgeting in culture and tourism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Statement on status of culture & tourism projects depending on relevance to gender equality issues (Open question) • Budget for projects with direct relevance to gender equality issues <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Level of adequacy and necessity of increase for each issue. (6 questions) • Budget for projects with indirect relevance to gender equality issues <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Level of necessity of gender-sensitive analysis (preparation of gender budget statements or gender impact assessment report) for each issue (6 questions)

The first round survey aimed to form a consensus on a gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism and to identify gender equality issues. Therefore, the survey was mainly broke down into two sections: ‘gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism’ and ‘gender equality issues in culture and tourism.’

As for ‘Gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism,’ a policy and investment plans for culture and tourism that the government has been currently implementing were explained with awareness that efforts for gender-sensitive access are not sufficient in the culture and tourism area. Then, it was asked to rate the level of adequacy of gender-sensitive perspective incorporated and the level of agreement on efficiency to be improved resulting from incorporation of gender factors on a scale of 1 (equates to Strongly Disagree) to 7 (equates to Strongly Agree). At the same time, the experts interviewed were asked to state their opinion openly on benefits from incorporation of gender factors in the culture and tourism area. With regard to ‘Gender equality issues in culture and tourism,’ the participants were asked to identify gender equality issues from gender-segregated statistics presented.

The contents of the second round survey were determined based on the outcome of the first round survey and broke down into three sections: ‘Gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism,’ ‘Gender equality issues in culture and tourism,’ and ‘Gender-sensitive budgeting in culture and tourism.’

Along with a total average score of the first round survey, the same questions on ‘Gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism’ were asked such that the experts were allowed to change their opinion. Additionally, more questions on necessity of gender-sensitive access to culture and tourism were developed based on expert opinions collected from the first

round survey and then asked for the participants to rate the level of their agreement. In the second section of the second round survey, the respondents were asked to assess the level of their agreement on the gender equality issues identified in the first round on a scale of 1 to 7 in terms of importance and timeliness.

In the third section regarding ‘Gender-sensitive budgeting in the culture and tourism area,’ budgets for culture and tourism projects were classified into three categories in terms of relevance to gender equality, as shown in Table 3, and based on which, the participants were asked to express their opinion openly. In addition, budgets for culture and tourism projects with relevance to gender equality issues were selectively identified and classified for each gender equality issue. With the results of the categorization, the participants were asked to rate the level of their agreement on necessity of budget increase for projects with direct relevance to gender equality issues on a scale of 1 to 5, and on necessity of a gender-sensitive analysis (preparation of gender budget statement or gender impact analysis report) of the budget of projects with indirect relevance to gender equality issues on a scale of 1 to 5.

The Delphi survey conducted for this study was based on a scale of 1 to 7 when asking to rate the level of agreement on necessity of gender-sensitive access, and based on a scale of 1 to 5 when asking to rate the level of importance and timeliness of gender equality issues identified in the first round survey. It’s because the variance of answers to questions about necessity of gender-sensitive access was expected to be larger than that of questions about gender equality issues identified. For that reason, a more detailed seven-point scale was used for the questions about necessity of gender-sensitive access and the average level of agreement was presented at the 95% confidence level.

The Delphi survey showed the high level of agreement on necessity of gender-sensitive access in the culture and tourism area. Gender equality issues identified by previous studies and this Delphi survey boiled down to six issues which correspond to major six projects of the ‘2nd Framework Plan for Gender Equality Policies.’ The six gender equality issues are ① Promote gender-perspective training on culture and art ② Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work ③ Enhance women’s representation ④ Prevent career interruption of women ⑤ Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination ⑥ Raise attention of government organisations. In terms of both importance and timeliness, they are prioritized in the following order: ⑤ Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination, ② Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work and ④ Prevent career interruption of women.

In the second round survey, budgets for culture and tourism projects were classified into three categories depending on relevance to gender equality issues (Table 2), in order to gather opinions on directions for gender budgeting in the culture and tourism area. The first category was a group of projects which are directly related to gender equality issues and include a gender equality issue(s) in the project goals. The second category was those indirectly related to gender equality issues; therefore, they have no direct relevance to gender equality issues, but have indirect impact on gender equality issues by performing a gender-sensitive analysis of projects (preparation of gender budget statement or implementation of gender impact analysis). The third category was projects which are mainly for institution management or capital investment, difficult to specify relevance to gender equality issues. A total of 203 government projects in the culture and tourism area were classified into above three categories, which showed that budgets for

projects with direct relevance to gender equality issues accounted for a very small percentage of 2.3%.

〈Table 2〉 Government Projects in the Culture & Tourism Area

(Unit: Number of projects, KRW · million, %)

Relevance to Gender Equality Issues	Number of Projects (%)	Budget (%)
Direct	3 (1.5)	87,172 (2.3)
Indirect	78 (38.6)	1,318,506 (34.8)
Difficult to specify	121 (59.9)	2,380,154 (62.9)
Total	202 (100.0)	3,785,832 (100.0)

Budgets of projects with direct and indirect relevance to gender equality issues were divided for six gender equality issues (Table 3). As a result, the amount of budgets for ② Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work accounted for the largest percentage, which was followed by ④ Prevent career interruption of women and ① Promote gender-perspective training on culture and art.

When the results of the budget analysis was presented in the second round survey, the largest answer was that the budget for direct projects was too small. The following reasons were cited: ‘Even though females are employed more than males in the culture and tourism area, most of decision makers are males, resulting in little attention to policy development and budget execution from the perspective of gender equality,’ ‘government projects in the culture and tourism area focus primarily on achieving policy goals related to culture and tourism, therefore, it is obvious that projects with no relevance to gender equality issues take up the largest percentage. However, the fact that only three projects are directly related to gender equality issues indicates lack of

effort for project development with consideration of the severity of gender equality issues.’

When asking about the level of necessity of budget increase for projects directly related to gender equality issues, projects for ② Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work ④ Prevent career interruption of women ⑤ Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination received the highest level of agreement. Likewise, projects with indirect relevance to above three issues also received the highest level of agreement on necessity of gender-sensitive analysis.

Therefore, it is suggested by the results of the Delphi survey that it is required to increase the budget of projects with direct relevance to above three issues, but also to conduct a gender-sensitive analysis of such projects. However, the results of categorization of culture & tourism projects by relevance to gender equality issues into the six gender equality issues showed that projects related to ② Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work and ④ Prevent career interruption of women are dominated while there is only one project related to ⑤ Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination. It is probably because most of the budget allocated to the culture and tourism area is intended for human resource development or industry promotion. In order to fix gender inequality in the culture and tourism area, it is needed to prepare gender budget statements for projects related to ② Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work and ④ Prevent career interruption of women, but also make a policy for ⑤ Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination in such way to implement related projects.

〈Table 3〉 Budgets for Each Gender Equality Issue in the Culture & Tourism Area

(Unit: No. of Projects, KRW Million)

Gender Equality Issues		Total No. of Projects* (Budget Amount)	No. of Direct Projects ** (Budget Amount)	No. of Projects with Gender Budget Statements (Budget Amount)	No. of Projects with Gender Impact Analysis Report (Budget Amount)
①	Promote gender-perspective training on culture and art	6 (40,625)	1 (20,527)	3 (29,197)	1 (3,788)
②	Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work	60 (1,044,312)	- (-)	7 (242,791)	1 (65,709)
③	Enhance women's representation (Low ratio of women at a manager level, including a head)	2 (29,333)	- (-)	- (-)	- (-)
④	Prevent career interruption of women	9 (239,554)	1 (34,434)	2 (45,675)	2 (45,675)
⑤	Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination	1 (32,211)	1 (32,211)	1 (32,211)	- (-)
⑥	Raise attention of government organizations to gender budget statements and GIA	3 (19,643)	- (-)	- (-)	- (-)
Total		81 (1,405,678)	3 (87,172)	13 (349,874)	4 (115,172)

* Total No. of Projects: the number of projects with direct and indirect relevance to gender equality issues

** No. of Direct Projects: the number of projects with direct relevance to gender equality issues

Based on such conclusions, several examples of projects for which gender budget statements should be prepared are presented in the Table 4 and it is expected that they will be used for project development and consulting regarding gender budget statements in the culture and tourism area.

〈Table 4〉 Examples of Project which Need to Prepare Gender Budget Statements

Gender Equality Issues	Examples	
	Project Title	Description
Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work	Promote the craft and tourism industry	Encourage to develop craft products, and promote the craft industry and enhance tourism competitiveness via support of sales and distribution of craft products
	Vitalize the urban and industrial tourism	Improve accessibility to local tourist areas via support of city tours, etc., and establish hubs for theme tours
	Invigorate investment on cultural contents	Invigorate the contents industry, and establish a safety net for employees via financial support to contents companies
Prevent career interruption of women	Promote Korean-style green ecotourism	Promote tourism, and vitalize local economy using green ecotourism resources representing Korea, outdated tour facilities and circumference trails
	Establish and support the tour guide system	Establish a foundation for the tour guide system by providing tour information in an accurate and efficient manner

Note : There is only one government project related to the third issue, thus it is firstly required to budget for such projects.

III. Case Analysis

A case analysis was performed of projects related to three gender equality issues that received the high level of agreement in terms of importance and timeliness in the Delphi survey - ① Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work, ② Prevent career interruption of women, and ③ Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination.

To start the case analysis, a review was performed of the overview and gender equality issue of target projects, which was followed by a gender-disaggregated expenditure incidence analysis (EIA) using available

gender statistics. Then, a comparison was made on the amount of government expenditures distributed to the subgroups of the beneficiaries of the target projects. Based on such results of the EIA, a FGI was conducted of beneficiaries or targets of the projects to identify causes for the results of the analysis and to develop plans for improvement.

With regard to the first issue ‘Ensure equal rights and opportunities for work,’ the project titled ‘Development of tourism professionals and organizations’ was analyzed. This project fell under ‘Promote and support domestic tourism,’ one of three activities under ‘Promote tourism industry,’ one of five programs of the tourism sector within the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism (or MCST). This project, with a budget of KRW 3,392 million in 2018, was one of seven projects under the activity titled ‘Promote and support domestic tourism’ and took up a relatively small percentage of the total budget of the activity (KRW 65,709 million). Since this project was one of exemplary human resource development projects in the tourism area, it was selected for this case analysis. The analysis was performed of the four subprojects of the project which are ① Development of tourism professionals, ② Training of tour guides, ③ Casino Resort Academy, and ④ Training of tour accommodation personnel, and a FGI was conducted targeting trainees.

A close look was taken into characteristics of tourism human resources and related gender equality issues. As a result, it was found that the ratio of female employees in the tourism industry is high, but they are very likely to experience career interruption due to childbirth and childcare. Consequently, females are engaged in unstable forms of employment than males. For that reason, the gender wage gap is more likely to occur in the tourism industries compared to other industries.

The results of analyzing the four subprojects and resultant implications are as follows: firstly, it is needed for female-dominated industries including tourism to set a performance indicator designed to measure treatment or employment quality rather than a reciprocity rate (training participation rate) for females. Currently, the female participation rate is set as a performance indicator of the four subproject because of concern over gender inequality which may result from the fact that tourism is a female-dominated industry but most of females are engaged in unstable forms of employment. Nevertheless, it is still important to measure a female reciprocity rate to determine the extent of gender inequality, after considering that two out of the four subprojects spent more budget on male beneficiaries which is probably because training programs are designed such that it is difficult for females to attend in terms of time or area.

Secondly, it is significant to secure more specific data on beneficiaries for each training program in order to conduct a gender-sensitive analysis of government expenditures for such human resource development projects. The ratio of government support or training cost is different depending on types of training, and additionally, more data is needed to estimate cost of each subgroup of the beneficiaries which can affect gender distribution. For example, the ‘Tour guide training’ project has different gender distribution for each language, therefore, a budget increase in a specific language means a government expenditure increase for a specific gender.

Thirdly, it is essential to conduct training on sexual harassment and gender discrimination prevention as mandatory training. Among the four subprojects, the ‘Tour guide development’ project is the only project to do so. Considering the nature of the tourism industry with the high ratio

of female workforce and service business, however it should be mandatory to conduct training on sexual harassment and gender discrimination prevention, and it is also shown in the FGI targeting trainees that such training is in high demand. If online training programs are opened to improve trainee convenience and submittal of training completion records is required prior to conclusion of an employment contract for a government project, training effectiveness will be improved and so will project efficiency.

For the second issue 'Prevent career interruption of women,' an analysis was performed of the project for 'Establishment of a working safety net for artists.' This project is within the activity for 'Capacity building for basic arts,' one of six activities under the program for 'Promotion, practising and industrialization of arts' financed by the general account budget of MCST. The project for 'Establishment of a working safety net for artists' include diverse businesses such as support for dispatch of artists, support for art preparatory fund, operation of voice of artists, support for social insurance for artist, etc. with an objective to create a stable working environment for artists. The budget of this project amounted to KRW 28,053 million in 2018.

When it comes to career interruption of culture artists, there are only two government-financed daycare centers in the culture and art area, and a work and life balance system is not established well due to different forms of employment and different natures of working environment. As is the case with tourism, female artists are doubly discriminated against under recognition that culture art is a female-friendly or performance-based area.

Under the project for 'Establishment of a working safety net for artists,' 'Support of part-time child care centers (Parenting support for

artists)’ is the only subproject with direct relevance to career interruption of women. For that reason, this project was selected for the analysis. The project is a case in point showing little consideration of a gender-sensitive perspective in the budget project in the culture and art area. It’s because gender factors were hardly taken into account in the process of discussing the welfare of artists and expanding the budget and contents of the project.

Government projects related to child rearing and childcare are intended to have a social responsibility for caring, and through which, support a work and life balance with an ultimate goal to help females maintain and develop their career. Therefore, it is very important to expand those who benefit from the project, regardless of gender. Sometimes, a gender benefit analysis is meaningless. Given the fact that there are more female artists than males with career interruption due to child birth and child rearing, it is expected that there is a huge difference between male and female demand for the project, the only project related to child birth and rearing. As is the case with EIA of Austen, Costa, Sharp, and Elson (2013), effects of project budget are likely to be different depending on the gender of beneficiary groups.

Implications from the results of the analysis are as follows: firstly, various policies and supports are required to maintain and develop the career of female artists. Especially considering that the impact of this project budget is different depending on gender, it is important to re-design policies and budgets from the gender-sensitive perspective. Secondly, it is recommended to conduct a gender-segregated demand survey and to build up gender-segregated statistics. From 2008 to 2010, researches to build up a database of female cultural artists were actively carried out, but discontinued due to restructuring of government

organizations concerned. Consequently, raw data is not enough to develop a related policy. Therefore it is recommended to conduct a survey and build up statistics to identify the status of career interruption of female artists.

Last, but not least, the project for ‘Development of public culture contents’ was analyzed for the third issue, ‘Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination.’ This project is under ‘Development of culture contents industry,’ one of four activities under the program for ‘Development of contents industry’ within the jurisdiction of the MCST. The project for ‘Development of public culture contents industry’ is one of the four projects under the activity ‘Development of culture contents industry’ and the budget allocated on this project in 2018 amounted to KRW 32,211 million.

As stated previously, ‘Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination,’ among above-mentioned six gender inequality issues, received the highest level of agreement in terms of importance and necessity for improvement in the second round Delphi survey. Given the fact that the Me Too campaign which originated in the USA in October 2017 spread across the board focusing on the culture and art area in Korea in 2008, the survey result can be interpreted in the following two ways: firstly, even though it was not revealed outside, a culture of sexual violence and gender discrimination is deeply rooted in the culture and art area, and secondly, such inherent problem became a social issue and surfaced in the form of a major gender inequality issue. Strictly speaking, the analysis target of this study was ‘Operation of support center for public culture artists,’ one of subprojects under the project for ‘Development of public culture contents industry.’ This subproject is the only culture and tourism project related to ‘Tackle gender-based violence and discrimination.’ From that

perspective, the amount of budget allocated to the issue can be interpreted to be KRW 1,493 million which is only 4.6% of the total budget of the project for ‘Development of public culture contents industry.’ Moreover, it seems that the issue was hardly addressed in the contents or performance indicators of the project. The analysis of this subproject significantly relied on a two-round FGI targeting experts in various genres of the culture and art area because the scale of the subproject is small and gender statistics are not available.

The analytical results of this project and resultant implications can be summarized from the following two aspects: what are actual conditions and structural causes of the sexual violence and gender discrimination culture in the culture and art area and how to create government policies and budgets to fix such problems.

Gender-based violence and discrimination in the culture and art area is characterized as a structural problem where characteristics of each genre and hierarchy in it became a structure with passage of long time. Especially for the culture and art area, long-standing practices in the creation process became a routine, and a hierarchical order took firm hold in some genres in the process of forming an order and structure of each genre. Based on such structure, gender-based violence and discrimination took different forms depending on genres.

Therefore, gender-based violence and discrimination in the culture and art area can be seen as a structural problem, not as an event, and such structure is a result from government policies on culture and art policies which are managed in such way to support genres. It is appeared that individual or organizational response to the problem is very inadequate, and even there are few organizations with regulations to deal with the problem. The vague boundary between sexual violence and gender

discrimination due to the nature of culture and art makes it difficult to make a prompt response, which inflicts more pain on victims and aggravates conflict inside the organization. What is worse, there is no enforcing regulation to punish offenders, which allows the problem to occur repeatedly.

With regard to that, the MCST, jointly with the National Human Rights Commission, formed a Sexual Harassment & Violence Investigation Task Force for the culture & art sector and conducted an investigation from March to June, 2018 after the Me Too campaign started. The task force came up with four policy recommendations which are ① Establish a dedicated organization to sexual harassment and violence for the culture and art community, ② Legislate a law on protection of the status and rights of artists to remove a grey area, ③ Overhaul related laws and regulations to exclude offenders of sexual harassment or violence from public support, and ④ develop a standard contract which includes preventive measures against sexual harassment, etc. and make it mandatory when a government subsidy is provided. However, it is indicated by opinions collected from experts participated in the FGI that such policy recommendations have several limitations.

How to create government policies and budgets to fix such problems comes down to absolute lack of budget for related projects. In general, such problems occur due to policy grey areas resulting from no specific organization concerned with policies on gender equality in the culture and art area. Therefore, it is urgently imperative to create a budget necessary to implement more realistic and executable policies such as develop related field manuals, establish and promote permanent authorities for reporting, mandate and financially support sexual violence prevention training.



KWDI

Korean Women's Development Institute

225 Jinheung-ro, Eun pyeong-gu
(1-363, Bulgwang-dong) Seoul, 03367, Korea
TEL 02.3156.7000 FAX 02.3156.7007
<http://www.kwdi.re.kr>